This marks something of an unusual event in our series of replays—the playing and analysis of a solitary game. Of course, RAID ON ST. NAZAIRE is a most unusual solitary game. It challenges the player to better the exploits of the British combined force in that famous action. As the reader will see, and hopefully come to appreciate, the solitary system devised here and eliminated German your opponent reacts with an intelligence and purposefulness rarely found in solitary games. It demands a mixture of skill and luck to defeat that shadowy figure sitting opposite. Don Greenwood, the game's developer and a fine player in his own right, takes up the challenge.

**0128**

**HARBOR DEFENSIVE FIRE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shot #</th>
<th>TH</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>DR/Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>550</td>
<td>Wyren 7/E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>534</td>
<td>Wrench 8/E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>525</td>
<td>Fenton 7/E</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Predesignated target; no To He DR necessary

**COVERING FIRE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shot #</th>
<th>DRM</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>336</td>
<td>Disrupt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>266</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gun 336 is my first target because it has the potential of wounding the most havoc. Historically, this was the position that stymied the landing at the Old Mole. If functioning when the troops hit shore, it can do great damage. Having disrupted it, I hope it stays that way long enough for my commandos to get ashore and eliminate it. Despite its importance, I couldn’t afford a second shot at it now. My second target was the 342 searchlight which will be effective in the upcoming Dockside Defensive Fire Phase.

**DOCKSIDE DEFENSIVE FIRE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shot #</th>
<th>TH</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>DR/Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>342</td>
<td>Boyd 6/T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>534</td>
<td>Wrench 8/E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>525</td>
<td>Fenton 7/E</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* * *

**GUN/SEARCHLIGHT RESTORATION/ILLUMINATION PHASE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>DR/(dr)</th>
<th>Zone Illuminated</th>
<th>Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 336</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Lost</td>
<td>Restored</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 342</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Effective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 142</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Effective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 412</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Z</td>
<td>Effective</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HARBOR DEFENSIVE FIRE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shot #</th>
<th>TH</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>DR/Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>550</td>
<td>Wyren 7/E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>534</td>
<td>Wrench 8/E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>525</td>
<td>Fenton 7/E</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DOCKSIDE DEFENSIVE FIRE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shot #</th>
<th>TH</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>DR/Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>342</td>
<td>Boyd 6/T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>534</td>
<td>Wrench 8/E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>525</td>
<td>Fenton 7/E</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**GERMAN ACTIVATION PHASE**


**END OF TURN: 0 Victory Points**

As usual, British losses begin to mount from the very beginning. Rodier’s and Stephens’ boats are in trouble after the German Harbor Defensive Fire. By the end of the turn, the commando groups of Haines and Burns are already gone. At this point in the game, the player’s decisions are rather limited. I can’t fault Don’s choice of targets for his covering fire. I will only call attention to his decision not to commit his boats to the killing field in A, and to his decision to use Nock to evacuate survivors.

**GERMAN ACTIVATION PHASE**


**NAVAL MOVEMENT PHASE**

To B: Campbelltown, Ryder, Collier, Wallic, Henderson, Bout, and Leit.

Remaining boats stay in the Approach Zone while Nock picks up six survivors from Rodier and Irwin picks up six from Stephens.

**NAVAL MOVEMENT PHASE**

To C: Ryder, To B: Hord, Plant, Falcon, Boyd, Fenton, Wynne, and Leit.

**COVERING FIRE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shot #</th>
<th>DR #</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>336</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**COVERING FIRE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shot #</th>
<th>DRM</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>336</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Destroyer is Pre-Designated target—no To Hit DR necessary

**DOCKSIDE DEFENSIVE FIRE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shot #</th>
<th>TH</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>DR/Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>342</td>
<td>Boyd 6/T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>534</td>
<td>Wrench 8/E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>525</td>
<td>Fenton 7/E</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**GERMAN ACTIVATION PHASE**

As it is, about the only good thing than can be said for this turn is that Irwin polished off the German AA ship on the first shot and Nock is in position to take an early powder with a full load of survivors. It’s hard to be optimistic about scoring Victory Points for survivors on Turn 2! Boyd moves into B to help dilute Dockside Defensive Fire away from the troop-carrying boats and to back up Wynne’s efforts against the Lock Gates at 212.

**LAND MOVEMENT PHASE**

BRITISH: Roy (6), Smalley (6) to 216, Rodier (3), Pardon (6) to 203, Chute (6), Brott (4) to 111, Swaine (6), Woodcock (4) to 336. [All demolition units are listed in italics. The current strength of British units is listed in parentheses.]

I don’t envy Swaine and Walton the task of taking out restored Gun 336 without Assault troops, but they have little choice. If they were to run, they could only reach 335 where they would be subjected to German fire.
to fire from 344 and 336 anyway. Although the survivors could then head toward their targets, I'm inclined to stay and try to knock out Gun 336 to help the ladies in the remaining boats. The move from the Southern Caisson is made to maximize the number of attacks against the two guns in the Pump House. The old adage about the best defense being a good offense is especially true in this game.

GERMAN: The Movement die roll is a "2", "2"/121 to 116, two "4"/1641 to 155, "2"/225 to 221.

LAND COMBAT PHASE

Attacker Target TH # D# TH dr Effect
Swaine (6) 336 6 4
Walton (4) 336 4 2
Roy (7) 222 A 6 2
Roderick (3) 222 A 3 1 2
Charles (4) 222 B 4 3
Brett (4) 222 B 2 4
Perdon (4) 222 B 4 4 5 Disrupts Gun
Smalley (8) 222 B 4 4 4
Roderick (5) 5 5 5 Eliminates unit
Swaine 336 6 4 Eliminates 4, ammo
Walton 4 2 2 Eliminates 2, ammo

DEMOLITION PHASE

Smalley (6) prepares his charges in the Southern Winding Station, but his attack has no effect and the charges are now at risk.

END OF TURN: 1 Victory Point

Two "4" in 155 consolidate into a "6" and a "2".

I don't necessarily agree that Swaine and Walton had little chance about landing. Certainly, staying at sea is dangerous; but coming ashore without protecting parties against a couple of guns is sure to garner casualties among demolition troops. On the other hand, if they had managed to eliminate the charge, the gun, dividends would have been obvious for those still to land at the Mole. But, this is the first crucial decision that Don has to make—a definite gamble, but that's the "name" of this game.

Meanwhile, the rush against the Pump House guns has become almost standard play for those who survive the wild ride of the Campbelltown. It's what happens afterward in this region that decides if the player has a chance at victory. Note how Don put Roderick on top of Perdon to absorb casualties. This highlights the need for support for Swaine and Walton before they go ashore.

0140

GUNSEARCHLIGHT RESTORATION/ ILLUMINATION PHASE

Unit DR/dr Zone Illuminated Effect
222 A 7 7 Restored
432 (3) 4 4 Ineffective
432 (1) 6 6 Ineffective
342 (5) A Effective
142 (3) D Ineffective

HARBOR DEFENSIVE FIRE

Shot # TH # Triad Target DR/Effect
Campbelltown 5 Turn Away MC [crew: 1 speed]
1 5 521 Platt 5 Turn Away, MC [crew: 1 speed]
2 6* 212 Campbelltown 4
3 6** 615 Irwin 7/8 to MC [crew: 1 speed]
4 5 644 Brett MISS

* THF increased due to fire on board.
** THF increased due to being caught in SL 342.

COVERING FIRE

Shot # BRM Triad Target Effect
1 +2* 113 336 Gun destroyed
2 +3 666 222B MISS

* Fleet has been reduced to 23 Gun Factors.
HARBOR DEFENSIVE FIRE
Shot # TH # Target DR/Effect
1 4 243 Burt 4/Fire, KO [Explodes]
2 4 311 Ryder 2/Stopping [rew-2]
3 5 461 Fenlon 7/Dev, MC [rew-2, 2, speed]
4 5 443 Burt MISS

COVERING FIRE
Shot # DRM Target Effect
1 +3* 123 S 344 MISS

* Foilta has been reduced to 15 guns with Nock out in the Open Sea.

DOCKSIDE DEFENSIVE FIRE
Shot # TH # Target DR/Effect
1 5 6 Boyd MISS
2 5 641 Burt 2/Dev, MC [rew-2, 2, speed]

NAVAL MOVEMENT PHASE
To C: Fenton
To B: Wynn (after entering C at high speed and evading 3 from Ryder and 2 from Burt)
To A: Horlock, Falconer, Boyd (after torpedoes and destroying Lock Gate 313)
Land at 336: Platt
To Approach: Henderson, Collier
To England: Nock

DISCRETION allows the better part of all, and boats are now heading for England. Things have been too bleak at the Old Mole to expect much chance of a pickup in the Avant Port. The corridors are on their own. Fortunately, Nock’s passage of the Open Sea was uneventful so that’s 3.6 Victory Points in the bank. He may or may not take Solace in knowing that Birney got ashore. Our presence next to Gun 344 did keep it from firing in the Dockside Defensive Fire Phase.

GERMAN ACTIVATION PHASE
A “5” Activation dice roll activates four Stroosnegg units: “4” in 455, “4” in 412, “2” in 236, and a “2” in 125

LAND MOVEMENT PHASE
BRITISH: Birney (6) to 326, Swayne (2) to 317, Walton (2) to 326, Wizong (5) to 326, Hooper (5) to 337, Newman (5) to 337, Woodcock (5) to 211, Burt (4) to 232, Smalley (6) to 232, Purdin (6) to 245, Chant (6) to 229, and Roy (6) to 245

There are two points in Wilson continuing to battle Gun 344 alone—even now that all troops are ashore—and he needs to reach the Power Station to shut down those shoreguns. Birney can’t reach 344 this turn anyway so he just moves out of harm’s way and waits for help from Hooper. Together, they should be able to silence Gun 344 next turn. Every one else heads for their assigned targets. Newman will draw fire from Flak Tower 434B away from Woodcock, aid the latter in placement of his charges. Newman will then be in position to move north across the Swing Bridge to help cover the northern Demo teams who are now protected only by Roy.

As it turns out, Chant remaining behind to blow the Pump House has no immediate effect on the northern push to the Caisson. He could not have reached any firing position to aid Roy in dealing with the German force in 245. However, it was faintly possible for the German “2” in 116 to reach 111 and bring Chant under fire—perhaps delaying his landing in that charge yet another turn. The biggest problem that I foresee arising from Don’s actions at the Pump House is that distance between Burt and Purdin must cover to reach their targets when covered by only one assault group.

LAND COMBAT PHASE
Attacker Target TH # TH dr DR/Effect
Roy (6) 245 6 2 eliminates 2
Purdin (6) 245 5 1 eliminates 4
Newman (5) 337 5 2
Woodcock (6) 256 2 2 eliminates 1 and same

*Long Range or Mortar Fire

DEMONLITION PHASE
Chant prepares charges automatically but has no effect and therefore his charges are at risk. Woodcock’s charges are prepared on a 2 die roll (need 6, 6) but only damage the Swing Bridge.

END OF TURF: 12.6+ Victory Points

0125 SEARCHLIGHT ILLUMINATION PHASE
Unit dr Zone Illuminated Effect
342 6.6 Z ineffective
412 4.6 A ineffective
342 5.3 B ineffective
142 2.1 D ineffective

HARBOR DEFENSIVE FIRE
Shot # TH # Target DR/Effect
1 4 264 Wynn 10/MC [rew-2, 2, speed]
2 4 236 Henderson 6/Dev, MC [rew-2, 2, speed]
3 5 474 Wynn 7/Dev, MC [rew-2, 2, speed]
4 5 441 Wynn 7/Dev, MC [rew-2, 2, speed]
5 5 556 Fenlon MISS

*TH is increased due to being caught in SL 342

COVERING FIRE
The foilta, reduced to nine functioning guns in Zones A, B and C has a +4 DRM and needs a “3” to Hit dice roll. It rolls a “6”.

DOCKSIDE DEFENSIVE FIRE
Shot # TH # Target DR/Effect
1 5* 261 Boyd 1/Dev, MC [rew-2, 2, speed]
2 5* 162 Boyd 1/Dev, MC [rew-2, 2, speed]
3 3 116 Falconer 4/Dev, MC [rew-2, 2, speed]
4 5* 462 Miss H3/Dev, MC [rew-2, 2, speed]
5 5 644 Wynn MISS
6 5 522 Fenlon MISS

*TH is increased by two due to being on fire and caught in SL 342

NAVAL MOVEMENT PHASE
Collier to Open Sea, Henderson in Approach, Horlock (after evacuating I from Falconer) and Wynn to Approach. Flett to B, Fenton and Pelham to 245.

I opted for an insurance attack against Lock Gate 212 with Fenton even though Wynn’s already hit him with his Delayed Action torpedoes. Fenton’s reduced speed and sorry condition make it unlikely he’ll survive, so I think it’s best to get whatever I can out of him now while he is in a target zone. The Damage DRM may be the difference when Wynn’s torpedoes detonate.

GERMAN ACTIVATION PHASE

LAND MOVEMENT PHASE
BRITISH: Swayne (2) to 317, Wilson (6) to 315, Birney (6) to 317, Walton (2) to 333, Hooper (5) to 352, Woodcock (5) to 211, Newman (4) to 245, Chant (6) to 322, Smalley (6) to 232, Purdin (6) to 256, Burt (5) to 245, Roy (6) to 255

Walon and Swayne are too weak to proceed to their targets unscored so they will hang back and wait for help. Birney and Hooper will have to forge the planned attack on Gun 344 to cover the Demo teams. Actually, there is little point in taking the gun out now anyway as the boats have all bought the farm. Birney and Wilson should be able to ambush the German “6” in 310. To the north, the four units in 253 and 256 not only have reached their Primary Targets but should be able to support each other with a crossfire to 255.

I see no point in attacking the gun in 344; it would be better simply to bypass it and get on with the job.
falls back to 327 for Hooper’s protection from the sudden appearance of Germans on Lock Gates 331. There are few Demolition units here to risk any of them prematurely. Birney moves to the probable destruction of the German “5” to help Wilson—improving his terrain position in the bargain.

Newman’s move to engage 354 seems pointless. That Swing Bridge in 343 looks to come under a great deal of fire—enough that eliminating this “2” is little gain. Better to have kept him safe by staying out of the path of the guns in 343 by moving south. Course, going that way will take longer. Personally, I’d just keep Newman where he is to protect Woodcock, and then accompany Woodcock looking for opportunities when the swing bridge is down.

GERMAN: The Movement die roll is a “2” and “4” and “6” in 511 in move to 408, “4” 484 to 492, “4” 611 to 493, “4” 261 to 262, “2” 162 to 433 to 112, “2” 112 to 112, “4” 311 to 320, “5” 310 to 315.

LAND COMBAT Phase

**Attacker** Target **TH** **# TH** dr **DR/Effect**
**Roy (6)** 262 6 6 **eliminates 2**
**Smalley (6)** 255 5 5 **eliminates 1**
**Birney (4)** 305 1 3 **eliminates 1**
**Woodcock (6)** 310 1 3
**Newman (6)** 434 B 1 3
**3/310 Birney 5 1 2 **eliminates 1, and ammo**

Again, Don is lucky in the exchange of fire, and Wilson faces no threat now.

DEMOLITION PHASE

Wilson (6) places charges [3]. Woodcock destroys the Swing Bridge at [3]. Hooper (5) automatically sets charges and destroys previously damaged Pump House. Pardon (6) automatically sets charges and destroys Northern Winding Station.

END OF TURN: 39.4 + Victory Points.

Three pairs of “2’s” consolidate in 112, 433, and 541.

0204

**SEARCHLIGHT ILLUMINATION PHASE**

**Unit** dr Zone Illuminated Effect
**412** 4 A effective
**432** 5 A effective
**442** 6 A effective

GERMAN ACTIVATION PHASE


LAND MOVEMENT PHASE

BRITISH: Birney (6) to 315, Newman (6) to 354, Smalley (6) to 324, Hooper (5) to 354, Woodcock (5) to 262, Pardon (5) to 233, Swaineley (6) to 253, and Wilson (6) to 253.

**Chant** is out of charge so he will move south to provide cover for the late attempts against the southern bridges. The Demo teams there are so weak that I dare not expose them to fire, but time is rapidly running out. If the German Movement die rolls improve, the southern bridges will be swamped. This may be the last turn that I have the luxury to voluntarily hold them back from their targets. Roy leads the assault against the Northern Swing Bridge in what probably amounts to a suicidal charge, but if that bridge is to be blown it is now or never.

Swing Bridge is no target now that they are swept up. Their last attempt to destroy the northern Swing Bridge failed.

GERMAN: The Movement die roll is a “6.” Therefore, only the “6” move, from 464 to 453, 456 to 408, and 406 to 409.

END OF TURN: 45.8 + Victory Points.

0210

**NAVAL PHASES**

Platt is finally dispatched in Zone B by the first shot of Harbor Defense Fire. The naval segments of the game are now open. Any searchlights which are restored will now be looking to shore for their targets.

GERMAN ACTIVATION PHASE


LAND MOVEMENT PHASE

BRITISH: Birney (6) to 410, Wilson (6) to 321, Swaineley (6) to 315, Newman (4) to 343, Smalley (5) to 330, Hooper (5) to 484, Woodcock (5) to 320, Swaineley (6) to 320, Pardon (6) to 262, and Wilson (6) to 262.

The northern Demo teams are going to really catch it this time. If they don’t blow the bridge this turn, there won’t be any of them left to try. To the south, I’ve finally bought Swamp and Walton an unmoled turn on their targets, but in their weakened condition, it may take quite a while to set their charges.

Hooper and Birney are sacrificed to buy time for Sweat and Walton to give it their best shot—Just as they were last time, gives them a chance to secure the objective. Give them some cover to Walton. At the end of the harbor, Birney is obviously trying to cover against the Germans coming up from the rear in 253. I see no reason to write these fellows off yet even though Don just wants the points for the swing bridge in 261.

GERMAN: The Movement die roll is a “3.” Germans move: “6” to 240 to 410, “4” to 409 to 413, “6” to 511 to 408, “6” to 451 to 439, “4” to 452 to 481, “6” to 463 to 261, “4” to 493 to 463, “6” to 456 to 492, “6” to 253 to 262, two “6”s to 415 to 155, “6” to 203, and “6” to 34 to 336.

LAND COMBAT Phase

**Attacker** Target **TH** **# TH** dr **DR/Effect**
**Smalley (6)** 261 6 6 **eliminates 4**
**Pardon (6)** 261 6 6 **eliminates 4**
**Birney (4)** 262 3 3 **eliminates 3**
**Hooper (5)** 262 3 3 **eliminates 3**
**Woodcock (6)** 434 3 3 **eliminates 3**

19
Again, Don’s luck holds good and Purdon and Brett both chalk up kills against their immediate threats. But Brett pays the piper.

**DEMONSTRATION PHASE**

Despite the heroics on the Northern Swing Bridge, Smalley’s charge still fails to blow. But in the south, Wilson prepares charges [4] and blows Lock Gates 331 while Woodcock does likewise [3] to Swing Bridge 343. This unexpected twin success cuts off the Assault teams on the mainland.

**END OF TURN: 57.8+ Victory Points**

**222**

**SEARCHLIGHT RESTORATION PHASE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>DR(dr)</th>
<th>Zone Illuminated</th>
<th>Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>432</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Effective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>412</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>ineffective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>342</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Effective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>142</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>ineffective</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**NAVAL MOVEMENT PHASE**

Minisweeper 223 and 224 withdraw to U-Boat Pens, thereby activating a “4” and a “6” in 443.

**GERMAN ACTIVATION PHASE**


**LAND MOVEMENT PHASE**

BRITISH: Smalley (2) to 261, Purdon (2) to 261, Chant (6) to 351, Woodcock (5) to 346, Wilson (6) to 320, Swaney (2) to 319, Birney (4) to 426, Hooper (4) to 432, Newman (4) to 432.

The cut-off Assault teams will try to fight their way to the Swiss border. Again, their best chances for survival are to attack the blocking forces I think. The best defense for the British is always a good offense. Sidestepping the “6” in 432 only delays the day of reckoning, and he may have more friends later. Smalley will man his charges to the end. All that remains for the rest is to use their remaining charges on a spare ship or two. I’ll concentrate on the tugs since they neither withdraw nor automatically activate Storstrups when boarded and are worth just as many points.

Don goes right at the German “6” in 432. Why? I would have been tempted to slide to 431 in my attempt to reach haven. After all, no others may show up, and the Germans can’t match the British movement.

GERMAN: The Movement die roll is a “6” only. “6”’s will move this turn; two in 135 to 126, 111 to 203, and 413 to 409.

**LAND COMBAT PHASE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attacker</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>TH #</th>
<th>TH dr</th>
<th>DR/Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Purdon (2)</td>
<td>261</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6/Gun Out of Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chant (6)</td>
<td>345</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6/Gun Out of Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hooper (4)</td>
<td>432</td>
<td>3**</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birney (4)</td>
<td>432</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6/Gun Out of Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newman (4)</td>
<td>432</td>
<td>3**</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Woodcock (5)</td>
<td>346</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swaney (2)</td>
<td>319</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birney (4)</td>
<td>432</td>
<td>3**</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smalley (2)</td>
<td>261</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purdon (2)</td>
<td>432</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6/Gun Out of Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* Long Range Fire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DEMONSTRATION PHASE**

Despite his remarkable proclivity for staying alive, Smalley must have been lying in the demobilisation class; his charges still refuse to blow.

**END OF TURN: 57.8+ Victory Points**

Figure 3: The situation is the south immediately prior to the Land Combat Phase of 0216.

Bad luck for the Germans. They could have had good shots at Brett and Birney.

**DEMONSTRATION PHASE**

Smalley’s charges fail to blow. Walton fails to place his charges [1], but Swaney places his [1], and destroys the Swing Bridge at 321 in an unexpected success.

**END OF TURN: 49.8+ Victory Points**

**0216**

**SEARCHLIGHT RESTORATION/ILLUMINATION PHASE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>DR(dr)</th>
<th>Zone Illuminated</th>
<th>Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>432</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>ineffective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>412</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>ineffective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>342</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Effective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>142</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>ineffective</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**GERMAN ACTIVATION PHASE**


**LAND MOVEMENT PHASE**

BRITISH: Purdon (2) to 262, Smalley (2) to 261, Brett (4) to 261, Swany (2) to 319, Chant (6) to 351, Woodcock (5) to 346, Wilson (6) to 320, Swaney (2) to 319, Birney (4) to 426, Hooper (4) to 432, Newman (4) to 432, Purdon (2) to 262, Smalley (2) to 261, Woodcock (5) to 346, Wilson (6) to 320, Swaney (2) to 319, Birney (4) to 426, Hooper (4) to 432, Newman (4) to 432.

As expected, the lads on the Penhouet Swing Bridge have bought it. Purdon and Brett exchange places in the vain hope that Brett can better protect Smalley long enough to blow the bridge. Chant, with no charges of his own to destroy the 212 Lock Gates, moves south so that the Germans crossing the Southern Caisson into Zone 2 will be closer to and attracted towards the firing to the north. The Assault teams in Zone 4 could be cut off if both bridges are blown, but that is a sacrifice gladly made for that unlikely event.

Actually, I would have held Chant in good terrain in 365 and shot down any German crossing of the damaged lock gates. This might take enough heat off the group at the Penhouet Basin to give them a chance to get back to 201 and then cross over. But Don has written them off completely.

**GERMAN**: The Movement die roll is a “5” only. “6”’s will move this turn; two in 135 to 126, 111 to 203, and 413 to 409.
GAME SUMMARY

The last struggles of the few remaining commandos are listed here in abbreviated form. At 0234 Birney and Newman were wiped out in 439—one area away from a successful escape. Wilson boarded and sunk tug 345 with his last Demo Charge. At 0240 Smalley (1) was finally eliminated on the Swing Bridge. His defective charges were passed to Pardon (1) who had no better luck in getting them to detonate. At 0246 Pardon was eliminated by Germans who entered the northern Swing Bridge and removed the defective charges. Wilson was eliminated at 0252, as were Walton and Swayne at 0258. Walton was eliminated while trying to place a charge on the last tug and Swayne was frustrated when the minesweeper he had prepared charges on was withdrawn to the U-Boat Pens. With it went the last remaining Demo Charges and any chance to score additional points.

Wynn’s Delayed Action torpedoes detonated and, with the aid of Fenton’s previous damage dm, destroyed Lock Gates 212 to bring the Victory Point total to 62.8. The game thus comes down to the final die roll. Twelve Victory Points for the destruction of the Southern Caisson will be sufficient for victory if the Campbelltown’s delayed charges can destroy the Southern Caisson on a die roll of 1-4 (thanks to the -1 drn for ramming at full speed). The inability of the destroyer to scuttle prevents another -1 drn. A damage result (die roll 5) or no effect (die roll 6) will result in a German win.

As luck would have it, these Germans must have been awake during demolitions class. Apparently they found the charges and managed to partially disarm them for the final die roll is a 5 and the Germans (i.e., the game system) win.

Note that in the historic operation, each commando officer was ordered not to be distracted from his primary target, to take the quickest and shortest route there, and to deal with the demoralization of that target while German confusion was at its height.

Wynn, in the conclusion to his piece elsewhere in this issue, notes that the player must use the Campbelltown commandos to garner as many points as quickly as possible. This makes Don’s choice of actions around the Pump House with Brett and Pardon questionable. With the half value added for the damaged Southern Caisson, he ends the game with 68.8 points. Consider, if they had not paused, had all gone into the Pump House at 0140 to maximize their time and movement, might not Don’s demolition parties have managed to eliminate, or at least damage, the bridge in 261. And, all other events being the same, would this not have given the British the victory?

Don’s sole tactical ‘error’ in this replay is extremely subtle, and a strong case can be made for the action he did take. I, on the other hand, am of the philosophy that to win you must push hard in the first few turns ashore, ignoring losses and keeping a steady eye on the targets for demolition. You can, almost invariable, ignore the guns that threaten and bypass them to reach your targets; let the assault troops deal with them. Being distracted by the troubles of one commando party may mean that others fail to complete their assignments. Pausing to deal with the Pump House party is a prime example.

But that’s the marvelous thing about RAID ON ST. NAZAIRE; it’s so easy to spot the decision that brings defeat in retrospect, and so difficult to say definitively that the decision was ‘wrong’. Any choice that leads to victory in one playing may well, when made under similar circumstances in the next, bring disaster. The strength of the game’s design is the flexible and always differing enemy response to your actions, unlike the rigid responses found in most solitaire games. RAID ON ST. NAZAIRE is a game that demands quick thinking in a rapidly changing combat environment and the constant willingness to take a deadly risk—the very apotheosis of the British commando.

I’ve not much to add to the concluding turns, as the primary action is finished and Don is merely seeing what becomes of his remaining remnants. As usual, Don’s play was excellent—with one exception.